



ERIC GIBSON
INTERIM DIRECTOR

County of San Diego

DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND LAND USE

5201 RUFFIN ROAD, SUITE B, SAN DIEGO, CALIFORNIA 92123-1666
INFORMATION (858) 694-2960
TOLL FREE (800) 411-0017

BOARD MINUTES

HISTORIC SITE BOARD June 18, 2007

Approved 8/20/2007

(NOTE: The minutes are a summary of the HSB meetings. Recordings of the meeting are available upon request. Comments are welcome)

ADMINISTRATIVE ITEMS

ITEM 1 – ADMINISTRATIVE

A. Board Administrative Matters and General Information

- **Call to Order**

6:35 pm

- **Members Present:**

Paul Johnson
Jim Royle
Eldonna Lay
Margie Warner
Vicki Estrada
Scott Moomjian

- **Staff Present:**

Gail Wright
Donna Beddow

Members Absent: Carmen Lucas (excused)

Staff Absent: Glenn Russell (excused)

- **Other General Information:** None

B. Conflict of Interest Declaration: None, however, Scott Moomjian disclosed an ex parte communication which he had with a relative of the Applicant for Item #3 (Hindman Residence) several months ago, prior to his appointment to the Board and prior to the scheduled hearing of Item #3. Very few details regarding the property were discussed and the communication will not prevent Mr. Moomjian from voting on the item.

C. Approval of May 21, 2007 Board Minutes

Approval of the May 21, 2007 Board Minutes; Motion by Scott Moomjian to approve minutes; 2nd by Eldonna Lay; motion carried 5-0-1 (Paul Johnson abstained).

D. Reports:

- CLG Grant for Julian Historic District –Donna Beddow: Results have not yet been announced by OHP.
- M. Wayne Donaldson, State Preservation Officer (SHPO) with the California State Office of Historic Preservation; Mr. Donaldson will not be retiring as announced.

E. Announcements

- San Diego County Archaeological Society meeting Saturday June 23, 2007, 7:30pm: **Presenter:** William Welsh: "Stone Bowls off the San Diego Coast."
- San Diego Archaeological Center June 23, 2007; the Center will host a public unveiling of its new, state-of-the-art compactable shelving. Held from 12 noon to 3:00 PM, with dedication ceremony from 12:30 PM to 1:00 PM; Reservations are required.
- National Preservation Institute: In San Diego: October 17-19, 2007: Section 106: An Introduction".

ITEM 2 – PUBLIC COMMENTS

A. Public Comment: None

B. County Department of Parks and Recreation: Dr. Lynne Newell. Christenson, Historian, County Parks and Recreation:

- Sweetwater Summit Campground: expanding to add additional camp sites
- Bancroft Rock House: Waiting to receive CCHE grant for historic structures report
- Open Space Preserves: Completed biological and cultural surveys using current funding; developing management plans for these resources
- Open Space Preserves: Future funding available for next fiscal year 2007-2008 for cultural and biological surveys as well as management plans. El Capitan, Stelzer Park and Oak Oasis; also Sycamore Canyon and Hell Hole Canyon
- Felicita Park cell site status – Undergoing 106 evaluation; mitigation not determined; RPO significant site; eligible for listing on the National Register

C. Presentation – none

ACTION ITEMS:

ITEM 3 - HINDMAN RESIDENCE, DESIGNED BY JOHN R. MOCK – MAA 07-003:

Location: 10636 Snyder Road, Mt. Helix; Valle de Oro Community Planning Group

Supervisor District: 2 – Dianne Jacob

Description: This home was designed in 1961 and completed in April 1962 for Dr. and Mrs. Robert Hindman. Designed by John R. Mock, this Mid-Century Modern period home is substantially unchanged since it was built 45 years ago. The home won the 1963 Grand Prize Award by Pacific Coast Builders and American Builder magazine, topping hundreds of other entrants from 13 states. Numerous other awards and recognitions were received. John Mock was only 28 years old at the time, and the Hindman home was only his second constructed home design. He would go on to become one of San Diego's leading architects, winning more than 41 architectural and design awards. This resource is consistent with the criteria of Section Vb3 of the San Diego County Register of Historical Resources that defines a resource as significant if it "embodies the distinctive characterizes of a type or period of San Diego County region, or method

of construction, or represents the work of an important creative individual or possesses high artistic value". This residence appears to meet all of these criteria.

This resource is 45 years old; the HSB Ordinance Section V.(d)(2) states (in part): "A resource less than 50 years old may be considered for listing in the Local Register if it can be determined that sufficient time has passed to understand its historical importance". The Hindman Residence appears to fit this description.

Staff Recommendation: Recommend placement of this house, on lot APN 497-011-28-00, on the Local Register of Historic Resources as Landmark Number 2007-003 and recommend approval for participation in the Mills Act contract. Staff finds this resource to be significant under Criteria V (b) (3), of the San Diego County Register of Historical Resources that defines a resource as significant if it "embodies the distinctive characterizes of a type or period of San Diego County region, or method of construction, or represents the work of an important creative individual or possesses high artistic value".

Meeting Notes: Owners Bryan and Jora Vess attended the meeting. Mr. Vess commented about the house and was available for questions; he stated that he enjoyed working with architect John R. Mock to obtain biographical history; Mr. Mock declined the invitation to attend, Architect Carmen Pauli with Heritage Architecture was contracted to provide interior decorating and remodeling, and also could not attend. Mr. Vess had concerns about the landscape designation requirement since application was for the residence only. However, because of the design of the house, the interiors that are visible from the public street should be included as well as mature trees, boulders and stairs leading to the house.

Board Action: Motion to approve staff recommendation (as amended by Scott Moomjian) by Paul Johnson, second by Vicki Estrada; Motion carried 6-0-0. The motion is as follows:

1. Pursuant to San Diego County Administrative Code Section 396.7(V)(d)(2), despite being only 45 years of age, sufficient time has passed to understand the Mid-Century Modern architectural significance of the building and of its architect, John R. Mock.
2. Pursuant to Section 396.7(V)(b)(3), the Hindman Residence:
 - Embodies the distinctive characteristics of a type, period, San Diego County region, and method of Mid-Century Modern construction with its flat roof, eave overhangs, mixture of stucco and wood wall cladding materials, extensive use of glass, posts, and beams, integration with the surrounding natural landscape, and seamless indoor/outdoor relationship;
 - Represents the work of John R. Mock, an important, creative award-winning Modernist architect who designed the residence at the age of 28 as only his second residential design, such that the design and construction of the residence was recognized and awarded numerous period awards and honors; and
 - Possesses high artistic values as a resource which so fully articulates the Mid-Century Modern design concept so that it expresses the aesthetic Modern ideal of using advanced building technologies, structures and materials in order to seamlessly integrate new design/construction into the surrounding landscape.
3. The designation of the property shall include the following:

The north, east and south exteriors which are visible from the public right-of-way and the rear west elevation;

- The interior walls and ceilings in the living room and gallery areas which are visible from the public right-of-way;
- The large boulder at the main entryway area and other original rock features on the site; and
- The railroad ties (steps) on the south side of the home.

ITEM 4 - HISTORIC SITE BOARD GOALS 2007 AND 2008

Description: Discussion and adoption of the Historic Site Board goals for 2007-2008. Board and staff discussed the first draft list of goals at the May 21, 2007 meeting. Setting goals is an on-going process that helps to guide the Historic Site Board throughout the year.

Meeting Notes: Goal (1) should include the requirement for a site plan that clearly highlights the area of the property to be included as a part of the historic nomination. Staff will revise Landmarking Procedures to include this change. Goal (11) add: Apply for grant for 2008 to survey the Mt. Helix area.

Board Action: Motion to approve staff recommendation (as amended) by Vicki Estrada, second by Paul Johnson; Motion carried 6-0-0. **NOTE:** Approved Goals are attached.

DISCUSSION ITEMS

ITEM 5 – DEPARTMENT OF PLANNING AND LAND USE DISCRETIONARY ITEMS

Description: Determining threshold at which DPLU discretionary projects should be brought to the HSB for action and comment. The Department of Planning and Land Use (DPLU) cultural resources staff reviews an extensive number of cultural resources reports every year that range from multi-volume surveys and evaluation of large development projects such as Merriam Mountain, Lilac Ranch or Oak Country Estates, with many sites (historic and pre-contact) to much smaller projects such as two to four lot parcel splits, site plans and major and minor use permits. Our data base, started about two years ago, contains over 600 entries (which do not include negative staff surveys and many other negative surveys). Since April, Donna and Gail have reviewed at least 40 consultant reports.

The reports range from negative surveys with no sites to a project with one or two sites (historic or pre-contact) that subsequent testing finds to not meet the criteria of significance of CEQA or RPO; other projects consist of multiple sites that testing and evaluation determine are significant under both CEQA and RPO. These projects would then require extensive mitigation from open space protection and possibly data recovery.

In addition, staff will survey projects under 10-acres if they have the resources to do so. Usually, these reports are negative; if not, the applicant is contacted to hire a consultant to further survey the property and test sites that are found for significance.

HSB staff has wanted to give the Board a chance to review some of these reports; however, the sheer volume of documentation could be overwhelming and staff will need input as to a threshold that would be manageable.

Considerations:

- The review options range from “all discretionary reports” – to “no discretionary reports”.
- Only reports with historic sites
- Only reports with significant sites
- Only major projects
- When in the process? First iteration; once approved by staff; during public review
- Consider an HSB subcommittee to screen reports, bringing to the whole board only that project that could benefit by board input.

Meeting Notes: Board members asked exactly what did DPLU want to accomplish with this action. Staff would need to specify what areas of a report to be reviewed. Applicant should know if the HSB was going to review a project. Reports taken to the board could be those with “grey areas” regarding significance and/or mitigation proposed. Training should be provided to the board as to best way to review reports and to make comments. The idea of a sub-committee to screen reports for review by the full board was thought to be a good idea.

ITEM 6 – FUTURE AGENDA ITEMS

- Next meeting will take place on Monday, July 16, 2007 (third Monday)
- Jamul Haven/Frank Gifford Queen Ann Victorian 1890 farmhouse in Jamul (tentative)
- Whaley House Porch replacement project (tentative); County Parks
- Discussion item: Continued discussion of threshold for review of discretionary projects
- Discussion item: GP2020 Cultural Resources section of the Conservation Element (handout available)

ITEM 7– ADJOURNMENT

8:10 PM

APPROVAL OF BOARD MINUTES:

Chairman, Jim Royle

August 20, 2007

Vice-Chairman, Paul Johnson

August 20 , 2007

**SAN DIEGO COUNTY HISTORIC SITE BOARD
GOALS FOR 2007-2008**

JUNE 2007

Procedures and Operations

- (1) Formalize into Department of Planning and Land Use Format staff procedures for reviewing incoming Historic Site Board projects, including the following: (HSB staff)
 - a. Review submitted documents for compliance with the HSB Landmarking procedures (procedures to be revised by staff to include requirement for submission of a site plan clearly showing all areas of a property to be included in the historic nomination).
 - b. Send documentation to HSB members in preparation for site visit
 - c. Coordinate site visit between HSB members and property owner.
 - d. Preparation of staff report
 - e. Put project on agenda as an action item; notify owner/representative
 - f. Post recommendation of approval actions to include application amendment, director's decision document; Mills act contract
 - g. Recordation of Mills act contract at the County Recorder; copy of recorded document to the assessor's office for evaluation.
- (2) HSB staff to work with DPLU GIS department to develop a GIS layer consisting of all County landmarked properties that will be flagged during the initial project review. All projects within 300 feet of a landmarked property are to be reviewed by the HSB staff and, as appropriate, the HSB. (HSB staff)
- (3) Develop policy for visits to archaeological sites. (Board)
- (4) Develop procedures for Board review of nominations to the National Register of Historic Places (NRHP). (Board)

Research

- (5) Expand the list of historic properties in the unincorporated area, and identify those that are potentially eligible for the Mills Act. (HSB staff, in progress)
- (6) Work with DPLU to identify approaches to prevent demolition of potentially-historic structures under ministerial permits, and demolition by neglect. (HSB staff and Board)

Outreach

- (7) Develop outreach materials for distribution to interested individuals and organizations:
 - Brochure with general information, site listing advantages, and procedures. (Board)
- (8) Contact potentially interested groups and offer to schedule presentations. (HSB staff and Board)
- (9) Enhance the HSB portion of the County's Website: (HSB staff, ongoing)

- Finish all areas “under construction”.
 - Maintain the Website as additional resources are landmarked.
- (10) Prepare annual presentation to the County Board of Supervisors (BOS), highlighting the landmarked historic properties in the County and the successful application of the Mills Act. (HSB staff and Board)

Grants

- (11) Apply for additional CLG grants:
- Review and update Julian Historic District information and submit eligible properties for California Register. (HSB staff)
 - ***To be reviewed and updated based on results of 2007 CLG Grant application.***
 - **Apply for grant (2008) to survey the Mt. Helix area**

Other

- (12) Ongoing periodic presentations and training at monthly HSB meetings. (HSB staff and Board)
- (13) Develop approach to obtain additional budget support for HSB staff. (HSB staff and Board)
- (14) Determine the threshold at which DPLU should bring a discretionary project to the HSB for review and recommendation. (HSB staff and Board)
- (15) Participate in development and implementation of General Plan 2020 Cultural Resources Goals and Policies. (HSB staff and Board)

Approved June 18, 2007